

APNIC EC Meeting Minutes

Singapore 5 March 1999

Room 204 of Suntec City Convention Centre, Singapore (during Apricot '99).

Meeting Start: 13:20pm

Minutes

Present

Lloyd Parker
Toru Takahashi
Geoff Huston
Che-Hoo Cheng
Prof. Dr. S. Charmonman
Xing Li
Paul Wilson
Anne Lord
Kyoko Day
Paul Gampe

Agenda

1. Introductions
2. Review of agenda for Members' Meeting
3. 1998 Annual Report
4. Legal and Tax Status
5. Meeting Voting Procedures
6. 1998 Budget
7. Member Services Report
8. Technical Services Report
9. 1999 Budget
10. Membership fee proposal
11. Policy Document
12. Confederation Memberships
13. ICANN ASO
14. IPv6
15. Next Meeting
16. Regularity of Members' Meetings

1. Introductions

- Meeting chair introduced attendees, including EC Members and APNIC staff. Lloyd Parker (APNIC's legal adviser) was introduced to provide an overview of APNIC's new legal structure and status, and would be available to answer questions.

2. Review of agenda for Members' Meeting

- Proposal made that a period be included for general business, in case of any issues to be raised. Agreed.
- Proposal to exclude AfriNIC and LACNIC reports, as representatives were not available. Agreed to substitute a section for 'Member Business', as proposed above.

3. 1998 Annual Report

- Paul Wilson presented a Review of the 1998 Annual Report.

- Question raised as to where discussions on APNIC's procedures occurred. Comments have been made that getting resources from APNIC has been difficult.
- Paul Wilson: Agreed that this issue is a high priority, and policies and procedures are under review. However significant changes could take 12 months or more, as members also require stability in their agreements and procedures, and sufficient notice of change.
- Comment made that APNIC's (and other Registries') basic operating principles should be open to discussion also.
- PW: Agreed, and stated that Secretariat is open to such discussion. Appropriate forum is "apnic-talk" mailing list, or direct email to Secretariat.

4. Legal and Tax Status

- Lloyd Parker presented a review of APNIC's current Legal and Tax Status.
- Discussion on schedule for winding up APNIC Ltd (registered in Seychelles):
- Kyoko Day : Reported that APNIC Ltd is still active and bank accounts are still being used, with some legal issues still not finalised.
- A question was raised as to whether new membership agreement will include a recurring service fee for non members (i.e. Maintenance Fee).
- KD: Human resources are still limited so it is not cost effective to enforce change (or track payments due). APNIC now has credit card trader status so will be able to charge ongoing non-member fees more easily.
- Comment that it is legitimate to charge annual registration/maintenance fees for non-members, and that these fees should be enforced. All agreed.

5. Meeting Voting Procedures

- Lloyd Parker recommended that the EC decide on voting procedure for the Members' Meeting. Recommended all issues and nominations be conducted in one voting session. The counting may be conducted as one process. Counting would be conducted in another room for one hour by independent scrutineers, who would then announce the results.
- Motion made by Geoff Huston that the EC be increased from 5 to 7. Motion seconded by Che-Hoo Cheng and all agreed. Comment that in last year's meeting, the confederation voting rights were not clear, and that the EC should clarify these prior to this Meeting.
- Suggestion made that members with multiple votes (including confederations) be given a number of ballot papers (corresponding to number of votes held), and that each ballot paper has the same weight.
- As four EC member positions would be elected, four (or less) nominations would be made on each ballot paper. If more than four persons nominated, then ballot is void. If numbers are entered for nominations, each carries only a single vote irrespective of numeric value.
- Recommendation was made that a single clear example be given to assist non-native English speakers.
- Suggestion made that Lloyd Parker and John Earls (of KPMG Consulting) be nominated to count the votes, then destroy all ballot papers.
- Recommendation made that all EC nominees get the opportunity to speak at the Members' Meeting.
- Motion by Geoff Huston that all nominations be accepted. Motion seconded and agreed.
- Question raised as to how the ballot papers were to be distributed.
- PW advised that the secretariat would distribute them to members at registration.
- LP: suggested that one hour may not be enough time to tally both the EC and issue ballots.

- Recommendation made for an earlier time slot for voting, prior to lunch. Agreed.
- General agreement was given to the voting procedure as discussed.

6. 1998 Budget

- Kyoko Day presented Membership and Financial Status Report, including Profit and Loss and Income Statements.
- Question raised as to how to handle funds received from Apricot'98 (this is expected to be a maximum of USD5000) Agreement that any profit from Apricot'98 should be retained by APNIC, in light of the large loss incurred in Apricot'97.

7. Member Services Report

- Anne Lord presented a review of the 1998 Member Services Report.

8. Technical Services Report

- Paul Gampe presented a review of the 1998 Technical Services Report.
- Paul Wilson called for comments from EC on any part of the Annual Report. No issues were raised.
- APNIC Annual Report for 1998 was approved.

9. 1999 Budget

- The 1999 Budget was presented by Kyoko Day.
- Observation that the budget was weak in that it assumes an increase in signup fees to cope with an increase in expenses. If customers not wanting services refuse to pay, then APNIC is not financially viable. Need to bring the withdrawal rate down to 5%.
- Suggestion regarding the possibility of recalling address space if customers refuse to pay.
- Question raised about practices at other registries?
- Secretariat reported that ARIN recalls resources from non-paying members. Agreed there was a need to ensure recurring revenue.
- Secretariat reported it would be necessary to include legal clauses in the membership agreement to allow APNIC to recall resources. Agreement that the secretariat should work towards implementing this before the end of 1999.
- Question raised about mergers and acquisitions, and comment that the new policy document adequately addresses this issue.
- Proposal that the membership agreement should be changed to include wording to ensure that new members pay ongoing maintenance charges if they leave APNIC. Agreed.
- Motion by Geoff Huston to approve the budget for 1999. Seconded by Srisakdi Charmonman and agreed.

10. Membership fee proposal

- Paul Wilson presented a proposal for APNIC members' category (S/M/L/VL) to be based on members' IP allocations. Reported that a majority vote at the Members' Meeting was needed to approve the fee change.
- Agreement to present this issue for a vote at the Members' Meeting.

11. Policy Document

- PW requested EC vote of support for the current Policy for Address Space Management in the AP region document.
- Comment made that this was not a voting issue until the document was finalised.

12. Confederation Memberships

- Secretariat reported that APNIC is not ready to accept further confederation memberships until the policies governing confederations were finalised.
- Motion made to continue suspension of confederations entering APNIC. Agreed.

13. ICANN ASO

- PW presented a summary of ASO discussions and open meetings held to date.
- Reported that the aso-discuss@ripe.net mailing list had been established to discuss the formation of the ASO, as a public mailing list.

14. IPv6

- PW presented a summary of IPv6 discussions to date.

15. Next Meeting

- INET'99 will provide the next opportunity for the EC to meet.
- A subsequent meeting in Brisbane was proposed and approved.

16. Regularity of Members' Meetings

- Discussion about regularity of member meetings, whether twice per year or more or less frequent.
- Comments raised that a single annual meeting was sufficient and that many members could not afford to attend multiple meetings.
- Agreement to hold one meeting per year unless circumstances required an additional meeting.

Meeting closed: 22:10.